

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
DALLAS DIVISION

ZENIMAX MEDIA INC. and
ID SOFTWARE LLC,

88

§

§

88

88

CIVIL CASE NO. 3:14-cv-01849-P

V.

OCULUS VR, LLC,
PALMER LUCKEY,
and FACEBOOK, INC.

88

§

§

88

Defendants.

§

**PLAINTIFFS' APPENDIX TO THEIR SUR-REPLY IN FURTHER
OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

DOCUMENT

EXHIBIT

PAGE(S)

Emails Between Counsel For The Parties Regarding Further Deposition Scheduling (highlighted)

1

1-8

Dated: November 16, 2015

P. ANTHONY SAMMI
E-mail: Anthony.Sammi@skadden.com
KURT WM. HEMR
E-mail: Kurt.Hemr@skadden.com
JAMES Y. PAK
Texas State Bar No. 24086376
E-mail: James.Pak@skadden.com
KRISTEN VOORHEES
E-mail: Kristen.Voorhees@skadden.com
DEVIN A. KOTHARI
E-mail: Devin.Kothari@skadden.com
(the foregoing attorneys admitted *pro hac vice*)
**SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE,
MEAGHER & FLOM LLP**
Four Times Square
New York, New York 10036
Telephone No.: 212-735-3000
Facsimile No.: 212-735-2000

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Phillip B. Philbin
PHILLIP B. PHILBIN
Texas State Bar No. 15909020
E-mail: phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com
MICHAEL D. KARSON
Texas State Bar No. 24090198
E-mail: michael.karson@haynesboone.com
HAYNES AND BOONE LLP
2323 Victory Avenue, Suite 700
Dallas, Texas 75219
Telephone No.: 214-651-5000
Facsimile No.: 214-651-5940

Attorneys for Plaintiffs
ZeniMax Media Inc. and id Software LLC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

On November 16, 2015, I electronically submitted the foregoing document with the clerk of court for the U.S. District Court, Northern District of Texas, using the electronic case files system of the court. I hereby certify that I have served all counsel and/or pro se parties of record electronically or by another manner authorized by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5(b)(2).

Dated: November 16, 2015

s/ Phillip B. Philbin

Phillip B. Philbin

EXHIBIT 1

From: Caplan, Matthew D. <mcaplan@cooley.com>
Sent: Wednesday, November 11, 2015 4:12 PM
To: Kothari, Devin A (NYC); Sammi, P. Anthony (NYC); 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'
Cc: Project ZeniMax IP DL; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)
Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Counsel,

Dov Katz is available for his deposition on January 15. Please let us know if that works for you.

Thanks,

Matt

Matt Caplan

Cooley LLP
101 California Street • 5th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111-5800
Direct: +1 415 693 2164 • Fax: +1 415 693 2222 • Cell: +1 310 528 1361
Bio: www.cooley.com/mcaplan • Practice: www.cooley.com/litigation

From: Caplan, Matthew D.
Sent: Wednesday, November 11, 2015 12:22 PM
To: Kothari, Devin A; Sammi, P. Anthony; 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'
Cc: DLPZENIMAX@skadden.com; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)
Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Devin,

We will see if Brant Lewis is available on December 14.

As for Palmer Luckey and Brendan Iribe, we would prefer to move forward on the dates we provided to you (as the witnesses and counsel on our end are available), and will work with you to schedule the other depositions around those dates. To that end, we will either confirm the dates in the notices you served last week or provide you with alternative dates as soon as we can.

Best,

Matt

Matt Caplan

Cooley LLP
101 California Street • 5th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94111-5800

Direct: +1 415 693 2164 • Fax: +1 415 693 2222 • Cell: +1 310 528 1361

Bio: www.cooley.com/mcaplan • Practice: www.cooley.com/litigation

From: Kothari, Devin A [<mailto:Devin.Kothari@skadden.com>]

Sent: Wednesday, November 11, 2015 9:49 AM

To: Caplan, Matthew D.; Sammi, P. Anthony; 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'

Cc: DLPZENIMAX@skadden.com; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)

Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Matt,

A couple of notes on deposition scheduling:

- Brant Lewis. Our schedules have shifted, and we are no longer available to take the deposition of Brant Lewis on December 4. Please let us know if Mr. Lewis is available for deposition on December 14.
- Brendan Iribé. We understand that Mr. Iribé has a number of obligations currently on his schedule, but we would appreciate if you could produce him for deposition at an earlier date. Please let us know if he could be presented for deposition in December or January.
- Palmer Luckey / January Depositions. We have noticed a number of depositions in January. Can you please confirm those dates, or provide alternates? Currently, your proposed date for Palmer Luckey (January 26) is sandwiched between dates for two other witnesses we have noticed. If those dates stand, please provide a date for Mr. Luckey in early February.

Regards,

Devin A. Kothari

Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP

Four Times Square | New York | 10036-6522

T: 212.735.2932 | F: 917.777.2932

devin.kothari@skadden.com

 Please consider the environment before printing this email.

From: Caplan, Matthew D. [<mailto:mcaplan@cooley.com>]

Sent: Friday, November 06, 2015 11:55 AM

To: Kothari, Devin A (NYC); Sammi, P. Anthony (NYC); 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'

Cc: Project ZeniMax IP DL; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)

Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Counsel,

Brant Lewis is available for deposition on December 4. Please let us know if that works.

Matt Caplan

Cooley LLP

101 California Street • 5th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94111-5800

Direct: +1 415 693 2164 • Fax: +1 415 693 2222 • Cell: +1 310 528 1361

Bio: www.cooley.com/mcaplan • Practice: www.cooley.com/litigation

From: Kothari, Devin A [<mailto:Devin.Kothari@skadden.com>]

Sent: Friday, November 06, 2015 8:45 AM

To: Caplan, Matthew D.; Sammi, P. Anthony; 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'

Cc: DLPZENIMAX@skadden.com; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)

Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Matt,

We are checking our schedules for Mr. Iribi and Mr. Malamed, and will get back to you. Please let us know if you will be proposing dates for Mr. Zuckerberg and Mr. Luckey.

Regards,

Devin A. Kothari

Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP

Four Times Square | New York | 10036-6522

T: 212.735.2932 | F: 917.777.2932

devin.kothari@skadden.com

 Please consider the environment before printing this email.

From: Caplan, Matthew D. [<mailto:mcaplan@cooley.com>]

Sent: Thursday, November 05, 2015 6:41 PM

To: Kothari, Devin A (NYC); Sammi, P. Anthony (NYC); 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'

Cc: Project ZeniMax IP DL; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)

Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Counsel,

Laird Malamed can appear for deposition on February 10, 2016.

Matt Caplan

Cooley LLP

101 California Street • 5th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94111-5800

Direct: +1 415 693 2164 • Fax: +1 415 693 2222 • Cell: +1 310 528 1361

Bio: www.cooley.com/mcaplan • Practice: www.cooley.com/litigation

From: Kothari, Devin A [<mailto:Devin.Kothari@skadden.com>]

Sent: Wednesday, November 04, 2015 4:21 PM

To: Caplan, Matthew D.; Sammi, P. Anthony; 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'

Cc: DLPZENIMAX@skadden.com; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)

Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Matt,

Regarding Mr. Lewis, the proposed December 15 date is unlikely to work for us. However, we will not stand on our notice, and ask that you provide alternate dates for December or January.

Regards,

Devin A. Kothari
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP
Four Times Square | New York | 10036-6522
T: 212.735.2932 | F: 917.777.2932
devin.kothari@skadden.com

 Please consider the environment before printing this email.

From: Kothari, Devin A (NYC)
Sent: Wednesday, November 04, 2015 11:27 AM
To: 'Caplan, Matthew D.'; Sammi, P. Anthony (NYC); 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'Istameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'
Cc: Project ZeniMax IP DL; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)
Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Matt,

We can confirm Mr. Marten on December 2. We will follow up about our availability for Mr. Lewis.

Regards,

Devin A. Kothari
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP
Four Times Square | New York | 10036-6522
T: 212.735.2932 | F: 917.777.2932
devin.kothari@skadden.com

 Please consider the environment before printing this email.

From: Caplan, Matthew D. [<mailto:mcaplan@cooley.com>]
Sent: Tuesday, November 03, 2015 7:07 PM
To: Sammi, P. Anthony (NYC); 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'Istameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'
Cc: Project ZeniMax IP DL; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael <Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)
Subject: RE: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Tony,

We are working on dates for these witnesses with our clients.

We can offer Brant Lewis on December 15. Please let us know if that works, and also let us know about Brendan Marten on December 2.

Thanks,

Matt

Matt Caplan

Cooley LLP
101 California Street • 5th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111-5800
Direct: +1 415 693 2164 • Fax: +1 415 693 2222 • Cell: +1 310 528 1361
Bio: www.cooley.com/mcaplan • Practice: www.cooley.com/litigation

From: Sammi, P. Anthony [<mailto:Anthony.Sammi@skadden.com>]
Sent: Tuesday, November 03, 2015 11:03 AM
To: 'rhodesmg@cooley.com'; 'stephen.smith@cooley.com'; 'mcaplan@cooley.com'; 'hkeefe@cooley.com'; 'mweinstein@cooley.com'; 'lstameshkin@cooley.com'; 'jwoodring@cooley.com'; 'FacebookOculusZenimaxMediaInc@cooley.com'; 'eryan@lynllp.com'; 'richard@rsmithpc.com'
Cc: DLPZENIMAX@skadden.com; phillip.philbin@haynesboone.com; Karson, Michael
<Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com> (Michael.Karson@haynesboone.com)
Subject: ZMI v. FB/OVR/Luckey: Further Deposition Scheduling (Jan 2016)

Mike,

Attached is an updated deposition calendar that includes January 2016. I've also included associated deposition notices for witnesses in January. As before, while we would like these dates, they are placeholders and I again offer you a calendar to mark up and return. In other words, if any of the dates on the calendar for any of your witnesses work, please confirm, and if any dates don't work please provide alternative dates as soon as practicable. I look forward to working with you to continue scheduling depositions.

We confirm Mr. Zoufonoun on Jan 19, 2016 (and have indicated as such on the calendar), thank you. We will revert on whether Dec. 2 works for us for Mr. Marten.

Regards,
Tony

P. Anthony Sammi
Partner
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP
Four Times Square | New York | 10036-6522
T: 212.735.2307 | F: 917.777.2307
anthony.sammi@skadden.com

This email (and any attachments thereto) is intended only for use by the addressee(s) named herein and may contain legally privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this email (and any attachments thereto) is strictly prohibited. If you receive this email in error please immediately notify me at (212) 735-3000 and permanently delete the original email (and any copy of any email) and any printout thereof.

Further information about the firm, a list of the Partners and their professional qualifications will be provided upon request.

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message. If you are the intended recipient, please be advised that the content of this message is subject to access, review and disclosure by the sender's Email System Administrator.

This email (and any attachments thereto) is intended only for use by the addressee(s) named herein and may contain legally privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this email (and any attachments thereto) is strictly prohibited. If you receive this email in error please immediately notify me at (212) 735-3000 and permanently delete the original email (and any copy of any email) and any printout thereof.

Further information about the firm, a list of the Partners and their professional qualifications will be provided upon request.

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message. If you are the intended recipient, please be advised that the content of this message is subject to access, review and disclosure by the sender's Email System Administrator.

This email (and any attachments thereto) is intended only for use by the addressee(s) named herein and may contain legally privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this email (and any attachments thereto) is strictly prohibited. If you receive this email in error please immediately notify me at (212) 735-3000 and permanently delete the original email (and any copy of any email) and any printout thereof.

Further information about the firm, a list of the Partners and their professional qualifications will be provided upon request.

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message. If you are the intended recipient, please be advised that the content of this message is subject to access, review and disclosure by the sender's Email System Administrator.

This email (and any attachments thereto) is intended only for use by the addressee(s) named herein and may contain legally privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not the intended recipient of this email, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this email (and any attachments thereto) is strictly prohibited. If you receive this email in error please immediately notify me at (212) 735-3000 and permanently delete the original email (and any copy of any email) and any printout thereof.

Further information about the firm, a list of the Partners and their professional qualifications will be provided upon request.

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message. If you are the intended recipient, please be advised that the content of this message is subject to access, review and disclosure by the sender's Email System Administrator.